



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

---

SECOND SESSION

THIRTY-NINTH LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 4 April 2012 — No. 92**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

---

### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

#### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Bernier (Montmorency) made a statement about the 8<sup>th</sup> edition of the Quinzaine du commerce équitable de Québec.

---

Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) made a statement to underline the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Le Pignon Bleu organization.

---

Mr. Lehouillier (Lévis) made a statement about the Centre interdisciplinaire de lutte au cancer of the Hôtel-Dieu de Lévis.

---

Mr. Ferland (Ungava) made a statement about regional educational boxing.

---

**4 April 2012**

---

Mr. Curzi (Borduas) made a statement about the 35<sup>th</sup> anniversary of L'Arrière Scène, a childhood and youth drama centre in the Montérégie region.

---

Mr. Pigeon (Charlesbourg) made a statement to underline the feat of Mr. Benoît Huot, who beat his world record in the 200 metre medley at the Paralympic swimming trials.

---

Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the founding of Ensemble vocal Voxapella.

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Alain Turcotte for having received the tourism distinction award.

---

Mr. Ratthé (Blainville) made a statement to underline the 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Plastigroulx.

---

At 9.57 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

**4 April 2012**

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.10 o'clock a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

Moment of reflection

### **Introduction of Bills**

Mr. Fournier, Minister of Justice, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

64      An Act to promote access to justice in family matters

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 64 was introduced in the Assembly.

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply from the Government to the petition tabled on 21 February 2012 by Mr. Ferland (Ungava), concerning the closing of a department at the Comtois sawmill in Lebel-sur-Quévillon.

(Sessional Paper No. 1164-20120404)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mrs. Malavoy (Taillon), committee chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, which met on 23, 28, 29 February, on 20, 21, 22, 27, 28 March, and on 2 and 3 April 2012 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 34, An Act to ensure the occupancy and vitality of territories. The report contains certain amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1165-20120404)

**4 April 2012**

---

Mr. Marsan (Robert-Baldwin), committee chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Culture and Education, which, on 22, 27, 28 and 29 March and on 3 April 2012, held public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 56, An Act to prevent and deal with bullying and violence in schools.

(Sessional Paper No. 1166-20120404)

---

Mr. Bachand (Arthabaska), committee chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Finance, which, on 28 and 29 March and 3 April 2012, continued the debate on the Budget Speech.

(Sessional Paper No. 1167-20120404)

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Robert (Prévost) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the prohibition for the Members of the National Assembly to change political party affiliation, and signed by 346 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1168-20120404)

---

Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the renovation of low-cost housing, and signed by 54 citizens of the riding of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve and its vicinity.

(Sessional Paper No. 1169-20120404)

---

**4 April 2012**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Malavoy (Taillon) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the renovation of low-cost housing, and signed by 174 citizens of the riding of Taillon and its vicinity.

(Sessional Paper No. 1170-20120404)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. St-Pierre, Minister of Culture, Communications and the Status of Women, together with Mr. Kotto (Bourget), Mr. Curzi (Borduas), Mrs. Lapointe (Crémazie), Mr. Charette (Deux-Montagnes), Mr. Khadir (Mercier) and Mr. Aussant (Nicolet-Yamaska), moved:

THAT, in marking the 35-year career of violinist Angèle Dubeau, the National Assembly underline her important contribution to the broader appreciation of classical music in Québec and internationally.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) moved a motion concerning the Neuville aerodrome; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

**4 April 2012**

---

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Gauthrin, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 57, An Act to modify the rules governing the use of photo radar devices and red light camera systems and amend other legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to give clause-by-clause consideration to Bill 58, An Act to amend the Act respecting the Pension Plan of Management Personnel and other legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 27, An Act respecting the Société du Plan Nord.

---

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Business Having Precedence**

##### *Debate on the Budget Speech*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been suspended on 28 March 2012, on the motion by Mr. Bachand, Minister of Finance, —That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Simard (Richelieu), Mr. Pelletier (Rimouski), Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin), Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau), Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. McKay (L'Assomption), Mrs. Malavoy (Taillon), Mr. Simard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata), Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) and Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean), subject to the receivability of these motions.



**4 April 2012**

---

The debate being concluded, Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, declared that the motions stating a grievance were receivable, with the exception of the motion moved by Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean).

On behalf of the Member concerned, Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, requested leave of the Assembly to replace the aforementioned motion ruled out of order by a new motion that complies with the Standing Orders. The motion deemed out of order could not be replaced for want of consent.

Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, then proceeded to put the question on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate on the Budget Speech.

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its 2012-2013 budget, which puts all the burden of the fiscal effort to restore fiscal balance on the middle class

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **74** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**    Nays: **60**    Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Government for having underestimated government expenditure by \$10.3 billion during the period covered by the Plan to Restore Fiscal Balance, following the method established by the Auditor General in his report entitled "Audit of Financial Information and Other Related Work – Report of the Auditor General of Québec to the National Assembly for 2011-2012", published on 1 March 2012.

**1095**

**4 April 2012**

---

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **75** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**   Nays: **60**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was next put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Pelletier (Rimouski). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for the 2012-2013 budget, which fails to respond to the report of the Auditor General of Québec, who considers that the doubtful accounts expense within the framework of tax recovery targets was significantly underestimated.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **76** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**   Nays: **60**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Government for having refused to decommission the Gentilly-2 nuclear generating station and for having set aside \$275 million for its refurbishment in the 2012-2013 budget.

**4 April 2012**

---

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **77** in Appendix)

Yeas: **41**   Nays: **66**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was thereafter put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government and its 2012-2013 budget for having disregarded public opinion calling for the abolition of the health tax and the cancellation of the \$1625 increase in tuition fees, for having failed to significantly increase public scrutiny and participation in the natural resources sector, and for having failed to lay the foundation for job creation in Québec based on a greener solidarity economy.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **78** in Appendix)

Yeas: **41**   Nays: **66**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its stubbornness in maintaining the health tax, which directly penalizes all Quebecers, particularly the middle class.

**4 April 2012**

---

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **79** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**   Nays: **60**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government, which, in tabling its 2012-2013 budget, has failed to fulfil its economic and financial responsibilities by attacking middle-class families and students, while proving its inability to defend Québec's interests in Ottawa.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **80** in Appendix)

Yeas: **41**   Nays: **66**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. McKay (L'Assomption). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for the lack of necessary resources to ensure the ecological planning of the entire territory located north of the 49<sup>th</sup> parallel and for its failure to commit to the environmental protection of 50 % of this territory.

**4 April 2012**

---

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **81** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**   Nays: **60**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Malavoy (Taillon). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Government for maintaining its 75 % increase in tuition fees over a five-year period, as well as for its stubbornness in refusing to enter into a dialogue with the students and thus work toward settling the student strike.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **82** in Appendix)

Yeas: **41**   Nays: **66**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Simard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Liberal Government for the lack of measures in the budget to help agricultural producers going through a crisis.

**4 April 2012**

---

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **83** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**   Nays: **60**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Liberal Government for having cut \$23 million in the investment plan for seniors.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **84** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**   Nays: **60**   Abstentions: **0**

---

Finally, the question was put on the motion moved by Mr. Bachand, Minister of Finance, –That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **85** in Appendix)

Yeas: **60**   Nays: **47**   Abstentions: **0**

---

At 1.14 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

**4 April 2012**

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.04 o'clock p.m.

---

**Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) moved:

THAT the National Assembly urge the Minister of Health to review the current prescription drug insurance plan to introduce a fully public and universal prescription drug insurance that guarantees adequate coverage and equitable access to prescription drugs for all the population of Québec, while increasing the disposable income of citizens.

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Mr. Ouimet, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this motion: 20 minutes shall be allotted to the mover of the motion and 10 minutes shall be allotted for his reply; 16 minutes shall be allotted to the independent Members; approximately 25 minutes shall be allotted to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; approximately 42 minutes shall be allotted to the parliamentary group forming the Government. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members shall be redistributed equally between the parliamentary group forming the Government and the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; and any time not used by the parliamentary group forming the Government shall go to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition and vice versa. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

The debate arose thereon.

At the end of her address, Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) moved:

THAT the motion by the Member for Mercier be amended as follows: by replacing the words "to introduce a fully public and universal prescription drug insurance that guarantees adequate coverage and" by the words "in order to improve coverage and ensure".

**4 April 2012**

---

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly urge the Minister of Health to review the current prescription drug insurance plan in order to improve coverage and ensure equitable access to prescription drugs for all the population of Québec, while increasing the disposable income of citizens.

The debate continued on the main motion by Mr. Khadir (Mercier) and on the amendment by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau), subject to the permission of its author.

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) refused the amendment proposed by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau).

The debate being concluded, the motion was negatived.

## **Government Bills**

### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Bolduc, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved, —That Bill 55, An Act respecting the professional recognition of medical electrophysiology technologists do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and Bill 55 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Gautrin, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 55 be referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Health and Social Services.

The motion was carried.



**4 April 2012**

---

Mr. Gauthrin, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 5 April 2012, at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 5.05 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 5 April 2012, at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*

4 April 2012

---

**APPENDIX**

**Recorded Divisions**

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau):

**(Division No. 74)**

**YEAS - 47**

Beaudoin ( <i>Mirabel</i> )	Ferland	McKay	Simard
Bédard	Gaudreault ( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Ouellet	( <i>Richelieu</i> )
Bergeron	Girard	Pagé	St-Arnaud
Bérubé	Hivon	Pelletier ( <i>Rimouski</i> )	Traversy
Bonnardel	Khadir	Picard	Tremblay
Boucher	Kotto	Pinard	Trottier
Bouillé	Lapointe	Poirier	Turcotte
Charette	Leclair	Rathé	Villeneuve
Cloutier	Léger	Richard	
Cousineau	Lemay	( <i>Marguerite- D'Youville</i> )	
Deltell	Malavoy	Richard	
Doyer	Maltais	( <i>Duplessis</i> )	
Drainville	Marceau	Roy	
Dufour	Marois	Simard ( <i>Kamouraska- Témiscouata</i> )	

**NAYS - 60**

Arcand	Charbonneau	Gonthier	Ouellette
Arsenault	Charest	Hamad	Paquet
Auclair	Charlebois	Huot	Paradis
Bachand ( <i>Outremont</i> )	Corbeil	James	Pigeon
Bachand ( <i>Arthabaska</i> )	Courchesne	Kelley	Reid
Beauchamp	D'Amour	L'Écuyer	Rotiroti
Bergman	Diamond	Lehouillier	Simard
Bernard	Drolet	Lessard	( <i>Dubuc</i> )
Bernier	Dubourg	MacMillan	Sklavounos
Billette	Dutil	Mamelonet	St-Amand
Blais	Fournier	Marcoux	St-Pierre
Bolduc	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marsan	Thériault
Boulet	Gaudreault	Matte	Vallée
Carrière	( <i>Hull</i> )	Ménard	Vallières
	Gautrin	Moreau	Vien
	Gignac	Morin	Weil

**4 April 2012**

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu):

**(Division No. 75)**

*(Identical to Division No. 74)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Pelletier (Rimouski):

**(Division No. 76)**

*(Identical to Division No. 74)*

4 April 2012

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin):

**(Division No. 77)**

**YEAS - 41**

Beaudoin ( <i>Mirabel</i> )	Ferland Gaudreault	Maltais Marceau	Richard ( <i>Marguerite- D'Youville</i> )
Bédard Bergeron	( <i>Jonquière</i> ) Girard	Marois McKay	Simard ( <i>Kamouraska- Témiscouata</i> )
Bérubé Boucher Bouillé Cloutier Cousineau Doyer Drainville Dufour	Hivon Khadir Kotto Lapointe Leclair Léger Lemay Malavoy	Ouellet Pagé Pelletier ( <i>Rimouski</i> ) Pinard Poirier Richard ( <i>Duplessis</i> )	Simard ( <i>Richelieu</i> ) St-Arnaud Traversy Tremblay Trottier Turcotte Villeneuve

**NAYS - 66**

Arcand Arsenault Auclair Bachand ( <i>Outremont</i> ) Bachand ( <i>Arthabaska</i> ) Beauchamp Bergman Bernard Bernier Billette Blais Bolduc Bonnardel Boulet Carrière Charbonneau Charest	Charette Charlebois Corbeil Courchesne D'Amour Deltell Diamond Drolet Dubourg Dutil Fournier Gagnon-Tremblay Gaudreault ( <i>Hull</i> ) Gautrin Gignac Gonthier Hamad Huot	James Kelley L'Écuyer Lehouillier Lessard MacMillan Mamelonet Marcoux Marsan Matte Ménard Moreau Morin Ouellette Paquet Paradis Picard Pigeon Ratthé	Reid Rotiroti Roy Simard ( <i>Dubuc</i> ) Sklavounos St-Amand St-Pierre Thériault Vallée Vallières Vien Weil
---	--	--	--

4 April 2012

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier):

**(Division No. 78)**

**YEAS - 41**

Beaudoin ( <i>Mirabel</i> )	Ferland Gaudreault	Maltais Marceau	Richard ( <i>Marguerite- D'Youville</i> )
Bédard Bergeron	( <i>Jonquière</i> ) Girard	Marois McKay	Simard ( <i>Kamouraska- Témiscouata</i> )
Bérubé Boucher Bouillé Cloutier Cousineau Doyer Drainville Dufour	Hivon Khadir Kotto Lapointe Leclair Léger Lemay Malavoy	Ouellet Pagé Pelletier ( <i>Rimouski</i> ) Pinard Poirier Richard ( <i>Duplessis</i> )	Simard ( <i>Richelieu</i> ) St-Arnaud Traversy Tremblay Trottier Turcotte Villeneuve

**NAYS - 66**

Arcand Arsenault Auclair Bachand ( <i>Outremont</i> ) Bachand ( <i>Arthabaska</i> ) Beauchamp Bergman Bernard Bernier Billette Blais Bolduc Bonnardel Boulet Carrière Charbonneau Charest	Charette Charlebois Corbeil Courchesne D'Amour Deltell Diamond Drolet Dubourg Dutil Fournier Gagnon-Tremblay Gaudreault ( <i>Hull</i> ) Gautrin Gignac Gonthier Hamad Huot	James Kelley L'Écuyer Lehouillier Lessard MacMillan Mamelonet Marcoux Marsan Matte Ménard Moreau Morin Ouellette Paquet Paradis Picard Pigeon Ratthé	Reid Rotiroti Roy Simard ( <i>Dubuc</i> ) Sklavounos St-Amand St-Pierre Thériault Vallée Vallières Vien Weil
---	--	--	--

4 April 2012

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau):

**(Division No. 79)**

**YEAS - 47**

Beaudoin ( <i>Mirabel</i> )	Ferland Gaudreault	McKay Ouellet	Simard ( <i>Kamouraska- Témiscouata</i> )
Bédard Bergeron Bérubé Bonnardel Boucher Bouillé Charette Cloutier Cousineau Deltell Doyer	( <i>Jonquière</i> ) Girard Hivon Khadir Kotto Lapointe Leclair Léger Lemay Malavoy Maltais	Pagé Pelletier ( <i>Rimouski</i> ) Picard Pinard Poirier Ratthé Richard ( <i>Duplessis</i> ) Richard ( <i>Marguerite- D'Youville</i> ) Roy Simard ( <i>Richelieu</i> )	St-Arnaud Traversy Tremblay Trottier Turcotte Villeneuve
Drainville Dufour	Marceau Marois		

**NAYS - 60**

Arcand Arsenault Auclair Bachand ( <i>Arthabaska</i> ) Bachand ( <i>Outremont</i> ) Beauchamp Bergman Bernard Bernier Billette Blais Bolduc Boulet Carrière	Charbonneau Charest Charlebois Corbeil Courchesne D'Amour Diamond Drolet Dubourg Dutil Fournier Gagnon-Tremblay Gaudreault ( <i>Hull</i> ) Gautrin Gignac	Gonthier Hamad Huot James Kelley L'Écuyer Lehouillier Lessard MacMillan Mamelonet Marcoux Marsan Matte Ménard Moreau Morin	Ouellette Paquet Paradis Pigeon Reid Rotiroti Simard ( <i>Dubuc</i> ) Sklavounos St-Amand St-Pierre Thériault Vallée Vallières Vien Weil
--	--	---	---

**4 April 2012**

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition:

**(Division No. 80)**

*(Identical to Division No. 78)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. McKay (L'Assomption):

**(Division No. 81)**

*(Identical to Division No. 79)*

4 April 2012

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Malavoy (Taillon):

**(Division No. 82)**

**YEAS - 41**

Beaudoin ( <i>Mirabel</i> )	Ferland Gaudreault	Maltais Marceau	Richard ( <i>Marguerite- D'Youville</i> )
Bédard Bergeron	( <i>Jonquière</i> ) Girard	Marois McKay	Simard ( <i>Kamouraska- Témiscouata</i> )
Bérubé Boucher Bouillé Cloutier Cousineau Doyer Drainville Dufour	Hivon Khadir Kotto Lapointe Leclair Léger Lemay Malavoy	Ouellet Pagé Pelletier ( <i>Rimouski</i> ) Pinard Poirier Richard ( <i>Duplessis</i> )	Simard ( <i>Richelieu</i> ) St-Arnaud Traversy Tremblay Trottier Turcotte Villeneuve

**NAYS - 66**

Arcand Arsenault Auclair Bachand ( <i>Outremont</i> ) Bachand ( <i>Arthabaska</i> ) Beauchamp Bergman Bernard Bernier Billette Blais Bolduc Bonnardel Boulet Carrière Charbonneau Charest	Charette Charlebois Corbeil Courchesne D'Amour Deltell Diamond Drolet Dubourg Dutil Fournier Gagnon-Tremblay Gaudreault ( <i>Hull</i> ) Gautrin Gignac Gonthier Hamad Huot	James Kelley L'Écuyer Lehouillier Lessard MacMillan Mamelonet Marcoux Marsan Matte Ménard Moreau Morin Ouellette Paquet Paradis Picard Pigeon Ratthé	Reid Rotiroti Roy Simard ( <i>Dubuc</i> ) Sklavounos St-Amand St-Pierre Thériault Vallée Vallières Vien Weil
---	--	--	--



**4 April 2012**

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Simard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata):

**(Division No. 83)**

*(Identical to Division No. 79)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve):

**(Division No. 84)**

*(Identical to Division No. 79)*

4 April 2012

---

On the motion by the Minister of Finance, – That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government:

**(Division No. 85)**

**YEAS - 60**

Arcand	Charbonneau	Gonthier	Ouellette
Arsenault	Charest	Hamad	Paquet
Auclair	Charlebois	Huot	Paradis
Bachand	Corbeil	James	Pigeon
<i>(Outremont)</i>	Courchesne	Kelley	Reid
Bachand	D'Amour	L'Écuyer	Rotiroti
<i>(Arthabaska)</i>	Diamond	Lehouillier	Simard
Beauchamp	Drolet	Lessard	<i>(Dubuc)</i>
Bergman	Dubourg	MacMillan	Sklavounos
Bernard	Dutil	Mamelonet	St-Amand
Bernier	Fournier	Marcoux	St-Pierre
Billette	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marsan	Thériault
Blais	Gaudreault	Matte	Vallée
Bolduc	<i>(Hull)</i>	Ménard	Vallières
Boulet	Gautrin	Moreau	Vien
Carrière	Gignac	Morin	Weil

**NAYS - 47**

Beaudoin	Ferland	McKay	Simard
<i>(Mirabel)</i>	Gaudreault	Ouellet	<i>(Richelieu)</i>
Bédard	<i>(Jonquière)</i>	Pagé	St-Arnaud
Bergeron	Girard	Pelletier	Traversy
Bérubé	Hivon	<i>(Rimouski)</i>	Tremblay
Bonnardel	Khadir	Picard	Trottier
Boucher	Kotto	Pinard	Turcotte
Bouillé	Lapointe	Poirier	Villeneuve
Charette	Leclair	Ratthé	
Cloutier	Léger	Richard	
Cousineau	Lemay	<i>(Duplessis)</i>	
Deltell	Malavoy	Richard	
Doyer	Maltais	<i>(Marguerite-D'Youville)</i>	
Drainville	Marceau	Roy	
Dufour	Marois	Simard	
		<i>(Kamouraska-Témiscouata)</i>	