



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTIETH LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 14 November 2012 — No. 8**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.46 o'clock a.m.

---

**ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

**Statements by Members**

Mrs. Weil (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) made a statement to underline the 100<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Club de curling de Montréal-Ouest.

---

Mr. Ferland (Ungava) made a statement to underline the 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Carrefour jeunesse-emploi de la Jamésie.

---

Mr. Billette (Huntingdon) made a statement about the Vignoble Le Chat Botté, International Cold Climate Wine Competition.

---

Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) made a statement to congratulate Épilepsie Granby on its 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary.

---

**14 November 2012**

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to underline the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Jardins de Métis.

---

Mrs. David (Gouin) made a statement to underline the 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Société de développement environnemental de Rosemont.

---

Mr. Dubé (Lévis) made a statement to underline the triumph of the "Libérez les livres!" project at the Gala Forces AVENIR.

---

Mr. Traversy (Terrebonne) made a statement to pay homage to Mr. Noël Therrien for his community involvement.

---

Mrs. Vien (Bellechasse) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Fannie Lapointe for her dedication within the Cancer Research Society.

---

Mr. Richer (Argenteuil) made a statement about the Argenteuil RCM, recipient of the "Leadership municipal" of the Fédération des municipalités du Québec.

---

At 9.58 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

**14 November 2012**

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.11 o'clock a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

Moment of reflection

**Introduction of Bills**

Mr. Bédard, Government House Leader, on behalf of Mr. Gendron, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

- 4      An Act to amend the Act to regularize and provide for the development of local slaughterhouses

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 4 was introduced in the Assembly.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Marceau, Minister of Finance and the Economy, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

- 5      An Act to amend the Act respecting the Québec sales tax and other legislative provisions

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 5 was introduced in the Assembly.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Gaudreault, Minister of Municipal Affairs, Regions and Land Occupancy, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

**14 November 2012**

---

8      An Act to amend various legislative provisions concerning  
municipal affairs

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 8 was introduced in the Assembly.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following  
Bill:

191      An Act to establish Pharma-Québec

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 191 was introduced in the Assembly.

### **Presenting Papers**

Mrs. Marois, Premier, tabled the following:

The 2011-2012 annual management report of the Ministère du Conseil exécutif.  
(Sessional Paper No. 116-20121114)

\_\_\_\_\_

Mrs. Zakaïb, Minister for Industrial Policy and the Banque de développement  
économique du Québec, tabled the following:

The 2011-2012 annual management report of the Ministère du Développement  
économique, de l'Innovation et de l'Exportation.  
(Sessional Paper No. 117-20121114)

**14 November 2012**

---

Mr. President tabled the following:

Copy of the letter, dated 14 November 2012, he had sent to Mr. Robert Dutil, Official Opposition House Leader, in reply to his letter, dated 8 November 2012, regarding the Opening Speech of the Session.

(Sessional Paper No. 118-20121114)

Mr. President read the following letter, which also served as his directive:

#### DIRECTIVE FROM THE CHAIR

The broad principles surrounding the delivery of the Opening Speech of the Session are the following. Firstly, it is through this speech delivered in the House that the Premier discloses the legislative intentions of the Government and the programme that will be submitted to the Assembly during the session. The Opening Speech of the Session is the first item of business under Business Having Precedence in our Standing Orders. Indeed, this is the very first action that the Government is required to take at the beginning of a new session. Since the parliamentary reform of April 2009, the Opening Speech of the Session now concludes with the introduction of a motion by the Premier proposing that the Assembly approves the general policy of the Government, a motion seeking the Assembly's confidence in the Government.

Owing to the important place that the Opening Speech of the Session holds within our parliamentary system, it is perfectly normal and legitimate for Members to want to know the major issues that the Government intends to examine during the session and, in addition, for this information to not be disclosed before they themselves are informed thereof. With this in mind, it is important here to recall the fundamental parliamentary principle to the effect that the major Government directions are disclosed to the Members in the House before the general public is informed thereof, as this is a custom that reaffirms the executive power's respect for the legislative power.

Moreover, it is a matter of respect for their role as controllers of the Government's actions that the Members must be the first informed of the content of the Opening Speech of the Session. For this reason, it is clear that the text of the Opening Speech should not have been disclosed to third parties before it had been read in the Assembly.

It is therefore imperative to remind all parliamentarians of the importance of exercising due caution when communicating information that is intended first and foremost for the Assembly.

**14 November 2012**

---

This cautionary note is addressed more particularly to the members of the Cabinet, owing to the numerous opportunities they have to communicate, through various means, the Government's policies that, in many cases, will materialize within the framework of the parliamentary proceedings. It is therefore important to always show deference to the Assembly and to its Members.

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Dubourg (Viau), together with Mrs. Maltais, Minister of Labour and Minister of Employment and Social Solidarity, Mr. Paradis (Brome-Missisquoi), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) and Mrs. David (Gouin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly pay tribute to Mr. William Cusano, former Member for the electoral division of Viau from 1981 to 2007;

THAT it express its sincere condolences to all of his loved ones who are going through a difficult period;

THAT it mark the important contribution of Mr. Cusano to the advancement of Québec and to organ donation;

Lastly, that it observe a moment of reflection in his memory.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the invitation of Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

**14 November 2012**

---

Mr. Spénard (Beauce-Nord), together with Mr. Dutil (Beauce-Sud), moved a motion concerning the financing of municipal political parties; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Lisée, Minister of International Relations, La Francophonie and External Trade, together with Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie), Mr. Duchesneau (Saint-Jérôme) and Mrs. David (Gouin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly underline the 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the presence of Québec in Brussels as well as the 30 years of existence of the Wallonia-Brussels delegation in Québec.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84.1 and 185, Mr. Hébert, Minister of Health and Social Services, together with Mr. Bolduc (Jean-Talon), Mrs. Daneault (Groulx) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly underline World Diabetes Day, a disease that affects a very large number of Quebecers and that it affirm its solidarity toward all persons suffering from this disease.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

14 November 2012

---

### Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Traversy, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 1, Integrity in Public Contracts Act.

---

Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources shall hold a deliberative meeting to inform the Members on the activities and operation of the Committee and to organize its proceedings.

---

### ORDERS OF THE DAY

#### **Business Having Precedence**

##### *Opening Speech Debate of the Session*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 13 November 2012, on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the motion by Mrs. Marois, Premier, –That this Assembly approves the general policy of the Government, as well as on the motions stating a grievance by Mr. Fournier, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Deltell, Second Opposition Group House Leader, Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), Mrs. Roy (Montarville), Mr. Lessard (Lotbinière-Frontenac) and Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine), subject to the receivability of these motions.

**14 November 2012**

---

Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, interrupted the debate and informed the Assembly that she had received a request for a debate upon adjournment on a question by Mrs. Roy (Montarville) to Mrs. Malavoy, Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports, about the postponement of school elections.

The debate continued.

\_\_\_\_\_

At 12.56 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

*Opening Speech Debate of the Session*

The Assembly continued the debate on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the motion by Mrs. Marois, Premier, –That this Assembly approves the general policy of the Government, as well as on the motions stating a grievance by Mr. Fournier, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Deltell, Second Opposition Group House Leader, Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), Mrs. Roy (Montarville), Mr. Lessard (Lotbinière-Frontenac), and Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine), subject to the receivability of these motions.

The debate being concluded, Mr. President declared that the motions stating a grievance were receivable.

Mr. Cousineau, Second Vice-President, then proceeded to put the question on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate.

**14 November 2012**

---

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fournier, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government and its Premier for the bungling and improvisation with regard to the economy and public finance, for their inability to put an end to the tax and economic anxiety they have caused since the election last 4 September and for their inability to propose concrete measures fostering job creation and economic growth.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 1 in Appendix)

Yeas: **44**   Nays: **49**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Deltell, Second Opposition Group House Leader. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for the improvisation, the lack of rigour and the dogmatic decisions that mark the beginning of its mandate and that are detrimental to the sound management of the State and the economic competitiveness of Québec.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 2 in Appendix)

Yeas: **44**   Nays: **49**   Abstentions: **0**

---

**14 November 2012**

---

The question was next put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its intention to further raise the taxes of Québec taxpayers without proposing any plan to reduce government expenditures.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 3 in Appendix)

Yeas: **44**   Nays: **49**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Roy (Montarville). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of vision and its improvisation with regard to private school funding, history instruction at the secondary level, and intensive English language instruction at the primary level.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 4 in Appendix)

Yeas: **44**   Nays: **49**   Abstentions: **0**

The question was thereafter put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lessard (Lotbinière-Frontenac). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for having caused concern and distress among our entrepreneurs and for its lack of vision regarding economic development and job creation in the regions of Québec.

**14 November 2012**

---

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **5** in Appendix)

Yeas: **44**   Nays: **49**   Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its plan to end linguistic peace, particularly with its new Charter of the French language.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **6** in Appendix)

Yeas: **44**   Nays: **49**   Abstentions: **0**

---

Finally, the question was put on the motion moved by Mrs. Marois, Premier, —That this Assembly approves the general policy of the Government.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **7** in Appendix)

Yeas: **47**   Nays: **44**   Abstentions: **2**

14 November 2012

---

**Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mr. Sklavounos (Laurier-Dorion) moved:

THAT the National Assembly reiterate the fundamental right of students to have access to their classrooms as well as to education, as recognized by the courts, and that it denounce all Parti Québécois Government actions that would have the effect of restricting or limiting this right.

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Mr. Ouimet, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this motion: 6 minutes shall be allotted to the mover of the motion for his reply; 8 minutes shall be allotted to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 7 minutes 15 seconds shall be allotted to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 2 minutes 45 seconds shall be allotted to the Second Opposition Group; 1 minute shall be allotted to the independent Members. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by one of the parliamentary groups shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in proportion to their representation in the Assembly. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

The debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **8** in Appendix)

Yeas: **60**   Nays: **47**   Abstentions: **0**

**14 November 2012**

---

Mr. Traversy, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 15 November 2012, at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 5.16 o'clock p.m., Mr. Ouimet, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 15 November 2012, at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*

14 November 2012

---

**APPENDIX**

**Recorded Divisions**

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fournier, Leader of the Official Opposition:

**(Division No. 1)**

**YEAS - 44**

Bergman (PLQ)	Drolet (PLQ)	L'Écuyer (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Blais (PLQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bolduc (PLQ)	Duchesneau (CAQ)	Lessard (PLQ)	(Montarville)
(Jean-Talon)	Dutil (PLQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fournier (PLQ)	Marcoux (PLQ)	(Arthabaska)
Caire (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PLQ)	Marsan (PLQ)	Sklavounos (PLQ)
Carrière (PLQ)	(Hull)	Ménard (PLQ)	St-Amand (PLQ)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Gautrin (PLQ)	Ouellette (PLQ)	St-Pierre (PLQ)
D'Amour (PLQ)	Hamad (PLQ)	Paradis (PLQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Daneault (CAQ)	Houda-Pepin (PLQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Vallée (PLQ)
Deltell (CAQ)	James (PLQ)	Rathé (CAQ)	Vien (PLQ)
Diamond (PLQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Reid (PLQ)	Weil (PLQ)

**NAYS - 49**

Beaudoin (PQ)	Duchesne (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	St-Arnaud (PQ)
Bédard (PQ)	Dufour (PQ)	Marceau (PQ)	Therrien (PQ)
Bergeron (PQ)	Ferland (PQ)	Marois (PQ)	Traversy (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Gadoury-Hamelin (PQ)	McKay (PQ)	Trottier (PQ)
Blanchet (PQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Trudel (PQ)
Bouillé (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Pagé (PQ)	(Saint-Maurice)
Breton (PQ)	Goyer (PQ)	Pelletier (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
Bureau-Blouin (PQ)	Hébert (PQ)	(Rimouski)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Cardin (PQ)	Khadir (IND)	Pelletier (PQ)	Zakaïb (PQ)
Champagne (PQ)	Kotto (PQ)	(Saint-Hyacinthe)	
Chapadeau (PQ)	Leclair (PQ)	Proulx (PQ)	
Claveau (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	Richard (PQ)	
David (IND)	Lelièvre (PQ)	(Îles-de-la-Madeleine)	
De Courcy (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	Richer (PQ)	
Drainville (PQ)	Malavoy (PQ)	Roy (PQ)	
		(Bonaventure)	

14 November 2012

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Deltell, Second Opposition Group House Leader:

**(Division No. 2)**

**YEAS - 44**

Bergman (PLQ)	Drolet (PLQ)	L'Écuyer (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Blais (PLQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bolduc (PLQ)	Duchesneau (CAQ)	Lessard (PLQ)	(Montarville)
(Jean-Talon)	Dutil (PLQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fournier (PLQ)	Marcoux (PLQ)	(Arthabaska)
Caire (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PLQ)	Marsan (PLQ)	Sklavounos (PLQ)
Carrière (PLQ)	(Hull)	Ménard (PLQ)	St-Amand (PLQ)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Gautrin (PLQ)	Ouellette (PLQ)	St-Pierre (PLQ)
D'Amour (PLQ)	Hamad (PLQ)	Paradis (PLQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Daneault (CAQ)	Houda-Pepin (PLQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Vallée (PLQ)
Deltell (CAQ)	James (PLQ)	Ratthé (CAQ)	Vien (PLQ)
Diamond (PLQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Reid (PLQ)	Weil (PLQ)

**NAYS - 49**

Beaudoin (PQ)	Duchesne (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	St-Arnaud (PQ)
Bédard (PQ)	Dufour (PQ)	Marceau (PQ)	Therrien (PQ)
Bergeron (PQ)	Ferland (PQ)	Marois (PQ)	Traversy (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Gadoury-Hamelin (PQ)	McKay (PQ)	Trottier (PQ)
Blanchet (PQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Trudel (PQ)
Bouillé (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Pagé (PQ)	(Saint-Maurice)
Breton (PQ)	Goyer (PQ)	Pelletier (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
Bureau-Blouin (PQ)	Hébert (PQ)	(Rimouski)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Cardin (PQ)	Khadir (IND)	Pelletier (PQ)	Zakaïb (PQ)
Champagne (PQ)	Kotto (PQ)	(Saint-Hyacinthe)	
Chapadeau (PQ)	Leclair (PQ)	Proulx (PQ)	
Claveau (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	Richard (PQ)	
David (IND)	Lelièvre (PQ)	(Îles-de-la-Madeleine)	
De Courcy (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	Richer (PQ)	
Drainville (PQ)	Malavoy (PQ)	Roy (PQ)	
		(Bonaventure)	

14 November 2012

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby):

**(Division No. 3)**

*(Identical to Division No. 2)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Roy (Montarville):

**(Division No. 4)**

*(Identical to Division No. 2)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lessard (Lotbinière-Frontenac):

**(Division No. 5)**

*(Identical to Division No. 2)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine):

**(Division No. 6)**

*(Identical to Division No. 2)*

---

14 November 2012

On the motion moved by Mrs. Marois, Premier, –That this Assembly approves the general policy of the Government:

**(Division No. 7)**

**YEAS - 47**

Beaudoin (PQ)	Duchesne (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	Roy (PQ)
Bédard (PQ)	Dufour (PQ)	Marceau (PQ)	(Bonaventure)
Bergeron (PQ)	Ferland (PQ)	Marois (PQ)	St-Arnaud (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Gadoury-Hamelin (PQ)	McKay (PQ)	Therrien (PQ)
Blanchet (PQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Traversy (PQ)
Bouillé (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Pagé (PQ)	Trottier (PQ)
Breton (PQ)	Goyer (PQ)	Pelletier (PQ)	Trudel (PQ)
Bureau-Blouin (PQ)	Hébert (PQ)	(Saint-Hyacinthe)	(Saint-Maurice)
Cardin (PQ)	Kotto (PQ)	Pelletier (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
Champagne (PQ)	Leclair (PQ)	(Rimouski)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Chapadeau (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	Proulx (PQ)	Zakaïb (PQ)
Claveau (PQ)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Richard (PQ)	
De Courcy (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	(Îles-de-la-Madeleine)	
Drainville (PQ)	Malavoy (PQ)	Richer (PQ)	

**NAYS - 44**

Bergman (PLQ)	Drolet (PLQ)	L'Écuyer (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Blais (PLQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bolduc (PLQ)	Duchesneau (CAQ)	Lessard (PLQ)	(Montarville)
(Jean-Talon)	Dutil (PLQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fournier (PLQ)	Marcoux (PLQ)	(Arthabaska)
Caire (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PLQ)	Marsan (PLQ)	Sklavounos (PLQ)
Carrière (PLQ)	(Hull)	Ménard (PLQ)	St-Amand (PLQ)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Gautrin (PLQ)	Ouellette (PLQ)	St-Pierre (PLQ)
D'Amour (PLQ)	Hamad (PLQ)	Paradis (PLQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Daneault (CAQ)	Houda-Pepin (PLQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Vallée (PLQ)
Deltell (CAQ)	James (PLQ)	Ratthé (CAQ)	Vien (PLQ)
Diamond (PLQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Reid (PLQ)	Weil (PLQ)

**ABSTENTIONS - 2**

David (IND)                      Khadir (IND)

14 November 2012

---

On the motion by Mr. Sklavounos (Laurier-Dorion):

**(Division No. 8)**

**YEAS - 60**

Bergman (PLQ)	Diamond (PLQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Rousselle (PLQ)
Billette (PLQ)	Drolet (PLQ)	Lessard (PLQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Blais (PLQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Marcotte (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Bolduc (PLQ)	Dubourg (PLQ)	Marcoux (PLQ)	Roy (CAQ)
(Jean-Talon)	Duchesneau (CAQ)	Marsan (PLQ)	(Arthabaska)
Bolduc (PLQ)	Dutil (PLQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Sklavounos (PLQ)
(Mégantic)	Fournier (PLQ)	Ménard (PLQ)	Spénard (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PLQ)	Morin (PLQ)	St-Amand (PLQ)
Boulet (PLQ)	(Hull)	Ouellette (PLQ)	St-Pierre (PLQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Gautrin (PLQ)	Ouimet (PLQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Carrière (PLQ)	Hamad (PLQ)	(Fabre)	Thériault (PLQ)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Houda-Pepin (PLQ)	Paradis (PLQ)	Vallée (PLQ)
Charlebois (PLQ)	Iraca (PLQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Vallières (PLQ)
D'Amour (PLQ)	James (PLQ)	Poëti (PLQ)	Vien (PLQ)
Daneault (CAQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Rathé (CAQ)	Weil (PLQ)
de Santis (PLQ)	Le Bouyonnet (CAQ)	Reid (PLQ)	
Deltell (CAQ)	L'Écuyer (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)	

**NAYS - 47**

Beaudoin (PQ)	Duchesne (PQ)	Malavoy (PQ)	Richer (PQ)
Bédard (PQ)	Dufour (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	Roy (PQ)
Bergeron (PQ)	Ferland (PQ)	Marceau (PQ)	(Bonaventure)
Bérubé (PQ)	Gadoury-Hamelin (PQ)	Marois (PQ)	St-Arnaud (PQ)
Blanchet (PQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	McKay (PQ)	Traversy (PQ)
Bouillé (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Ouellet (PQ)	Trottier (PQ)
Breton (PQ)	Goyer (PQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Trudel (PQ)
Bureau-Blouin (PQ)	Hébert (PQ)	Pelletier (PQ)	(Saint-Maurice)
Cardin (PQ)	Kotto (PQ)	(Rimouski)	Turcotte (PQ)
Champagne (PQ)	Larouche (PQ)	Pelletier (PQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Chapadeau (PQ)	Leclair (PQ)	(Saint-Hyacinthe)	Zakaïb (PQ)
Claveau (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	Proulx (PQ)	
De Courcy (PQ)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Richard (PQ)	
Drainville (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	(Îles-de-la-Madeleine)	

*Published by:*

*The Parliamentary Proceedings Directorate  
National Assembly  
Pamphile-Le May Building  
Room 2.15  
Québec (Québec) G1A 1A3*

*Telephone: 418 643-2793  
Fax: 418 643-0931  
seance@assnat.qc.ca*

ISSN 0825-9593