



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTIETH LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Thursday, 26 September 2013 — No. 74**

**President of the National Assembly:**  
**Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.46 o'clock a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Kotto (Bourget) made a statement about the Journées de la culture.

---

Mr. Lessard (Lotbinière-Frontenac) made a statement about the 72<sup>nd</sup> annual convention of the Fédération québécoise des municipalités.

---

Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) made a statement about the 65<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Patro de Jonquière.

---

Mrs. Gaudreault (Hull) made a statement to underline the 35 years of the Centre d'éducation de base dans l'Outaouais.

---

Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Caroline Gosselin and to the Miner Heritage Farm project.

---

**26 September 2013**

---

Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Paul Dussault.

---

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) made a statement about poverty and social exclusion.

---

Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) made a statement about the 35<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Concours hippique de la ville de Lévis.

---

Mrs. Vallières (Richmond) made a statement about the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of P'tit Bonheur de Saint-Camille.

---

Mrs. Hivon (Joliette) made a statement about World Day of the Deaf.

---

At 9.58 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.09 o'clock a.m.

---

26 September 2013

---

Moment of reflection

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Bédard, Minister responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, tabled the following:

The 2012-2015 strategic plan of the Centre de services partagés du Québec;  
(Sessional Paper No. 998-20130926)

The 2012-2013 annual report of the Société immobilière du Québec;  
(Sessional Paper No. 999-20130926)

The 2012-2013 activity report of Infrastructure Québec.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1000-20130926)

---

Mr. Blanchet, Minister of Sustainable Development, Environment, Wildlife and Parks, tabled the following:

The 2012-2013 annual report of the Fondation de la faune du Québec;  
(Sessional Paper No. 1001-20130926)

The 2012-2013 annual report of the James Bay Advisory Committee on the Environment;  
(Sessional Paper No. 1002-20130926)

The 2012-2013 annual management report of the Bureau d'audiences publiques sur l'environnement.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1003-20130926)

---

**26 September 2013**

---

Mrs. Hivon, Minister for Social Services and Youth Protection, tabled the following:

The 2012-2013 annual management report of the Office des personnes handicapées du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1004-20130926)

---

Mr. Hébert, Minister of Health and Social Services, tabled the following:

The 2012-2013 annual management report of the Institut national de santé publique du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 1005-20130926)

The 2012-2013 annual management report of the Commissaire à la santé et au bien-être;

(Sessional Paper No. 1006-20130926)

The 2012-2013 annual management report of the Centre régional de santé et de services sociaux de la Baie-James;

(Sessional Paper No. 1007-20130926)

The 2012-2013 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure and the improvement of the quality of services of the Centre régional de santé et de services sociaux de la Baie-James;

(Sessional Paper No. 1008-20130926)

The 2012-2013 annual management report of the Institut national d'excellence en santé et en services sociaux.

(Sessional Paper No. 1009-20130926)

26 September 2013

---

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Pelletier (Rimouski), committee chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Finance, which, on 24 and 25 September 2013, held public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 41, An Act to amend the Public Service Act mainly with respect to staffing.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1010-20130926)

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Pelletier (Saint-Hyacinthe) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the financing of the Commission scolaire de Sorel-Tracy for support staff, and signed by 157 citizens of Québec.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1011-20130926)

---

Mrs. Trudel (Charlesbourg) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting accessibility and use of the Jardin zoologique du Québec site, and signed by 218 citizens of Québec.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1012-20130926)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, the abstracts of two petitions respecting a grant application for a performing arts hall in Repentigny were tabled:

- the first, being the abstract of a petition signed by 4643 citizens of Québec, by Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie);  
(Sessional Paper No. 1013-20130926)

**26 September 2013**

---

- the second, being the abstract of a petition signed by 4637 citizens of Québec, by Mr. McKay (Repentigny).  
(Sessional Paper No. 1014-20130926)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Trudel (Charlesbourg) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting accessibility and use of the Jardin zoologique du Québec site, and signed by 208 citizens of Québec.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1015-20130926)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Roy (Montarville) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting a grant application for a performing arts hall in Repentigny, and signed by 4632 citizens of Québec.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1016-20130926)

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

Mr. President gave a ruling on the point of privilege or contempt raised by the Second Opposition Group House Leader on 14 June 2013, in which he invoked that the President and Chief Executive Officer of the Fondation du Centre hospitalier de l'Université de Montréal, Mr. Ekram Antoine Rabbat, had been in contempt of Parliament. The latter allegedly infringed the rights of the Assembly by providing false or incomplete testimony to the Committee on Health and Social Services, on 11 June 2013, thereby failing to comply with section 55(2) of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*.



#### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

When a point of privilege is raised, the President's role is not to establish whether or not contempt occurred but rather to determine if the facts adduced constitute, at first glance, a breach of rights or privileges or, in this case, contempt of Parliament.

While carrying out its mandate, the Committee on Health and Social Services heard Mr. Rabbat on 11 June 2013. His testimony mainly concerned the possible participation of the Fondation du CHUM in an additional remuneration of \$30,000 granted to the director general of the CHUM.

During his testimony before the Committee, Mr. Rabbat categorically stated on several occasions that he was unaware that the amount requested of the Fondation could be used to increase the remuneration of the director general of the CHUM. Hence, the day after this testimony, the Committee received documents indicating that this possibility had been brought up in an exchange of emails to which Mr. Rabbat was party. On the basis of these documents, the Committee noted, in the report it tabled in the Assembly, that some of the information received contradicted the testimonies heard.

The answers provided by Mr. Rabbat during his testimony suggest that he was absolutely unaware of the discussions surrounding the additional remuneration of the director general of the CHUM. Thus, from the facts submitted to the Chair it appears that he would have had access to information enabling him to know that the Université de Montréal wished to obtain a contribution from the Fondation and that it could serve to increase the remuneration of the director general of the CHUM.

In carrying out the various orders they receive, committees must be able to count on the full cooperation of those who take part in their proceedings. Witnesses have the obligation to tell the truth and to give complete versions of the facts.

As the facts submitted in support of the point of law or privilege may raise doubts as to the veracity of Mr. Rabbat's testimony, the Chair must declare that the point of privilege is, at first glance, in order.

That being said, the Chair takes the opportunity to clarify the status of parliamentary law that applies with regard to the second paragraph of section 55 of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*. Regardless of the manner in which persons are called upon to give testimony before a committee, by simple invitation or subpoena, the fact remains that when they take part in parliamentary proceedings, persons have the duty to fully cooperate and tell the truth. It is therefore important to remember that the act of giving false or incomplete answers to questions asked by Members constitutes, at first glance, interference with the exercise of the duties of the Assembly as well as contempt of its authority and dignity.

### Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mrs. Blais (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne) tabled the following:

Copy of a letter, dated 5 July 2013, from the executive of the Canadian Union of Public Employees, Local 4723, signed by Mr. Benoit Piché, President of the Local, Mrs. Lyne Masson, Vice-President, Mrs. Nathalie Horth, Treasurer and Secretary General, Mrs. Johane Harell, Occupational Health and Safety Officer and Director, and Mr. José Cacérès, Vice-President, concerning cuts, significant position abolishments, including approximately 30 nursing positions, and the reorganization of health care.

(Sessional Paper No. 1017-20130926)

---

Mr. President heard additional comments from the three House leaders of the parliamentary groups, with regard to the request for a directive made at the sitting of 24 September 2013 by Mr. Deltell, Second Opposition Group House Leader, and which he had taken under advisement, concerning the second supplementary question that Mr. Dubé (Lévis) was unable to ask at the sitting of 19 September 2013 owing to the end of Oral Question Period.

Mr. President took the matter under advisement.

26 September 2013

---

**Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Roy (Arthabaska), together with Mrs. Maltais, Minister responsible for the Status of Women, Mrs. Vallée (Gatineau) and Mrs. David (Gouin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly denounce the holding of Mini-Miss pageants in Québec;

THAT it denounce the hypersexualization of young girls and encourage all initiatives aiming to raise their awareness about the dangers of the culture of beauty, thinness and appearance.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Bureau-Blouin (Laval-des-Rapides), together with Mrs. Charbonneau (Mille-Îles), Mrs. Roy (Montarville) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly use the holding of the Week Against Bullying and Violence in School, which will be held from 30 September to 4 October 2013, as an opportunity to underline the importance of initiatives aiming to make school a welcoming and safe place for all students.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Charlebois (Soulanges), together with Mr. Bérubé, Minister for Tourism, Mrs. Trudel (Charlesbourg) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

**26 September 2013**

---

THAT the National Assembly underline World Tourism Day celebrated since 1980, at the initiative of the World Tourism Organization. September 27 was designated as the day marking the anniversary of the adoption of the Statutes of the World Tourism Organization in 1970;

THAT it take this opportunity to grasp the importance of tourism from a social, cultural and economic standpoint;

THAT it particularly congratulate the stakeholders of this industry, which represents 30,000 businesses and some 400,000 jobs throughout the province;

THAT it reflect the essential contribution of the tourism industry to Québec's economic development.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Traversy, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 43, Mining Act;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 27, Social Economy Act;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 45, An Act respecting the Ministère de l'Enseignement supérieur, de la Recherche, de la Science et de la Technologie;
- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 52, An Act respecting end-of-life care.

**26 September 2013**

---

Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, within the framework of the hearing with the chief executive officer of the Conseil de gestion de l'assurance parentale and the examination of the report on the implementation of the *Parental Insurance Act*, shall hold a deliberative meeting to prepare this hearing; it shall then hold a public meeting to hear the chief executive officer of the Conseil de gestion de l'assurance parentale; and, finally, it shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the Committee's observations, conclusions and recommendations, if any;
- the Committee on Public Finance shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the terms and conditions related to the order provided for in Standing Order 292 on the examination of the Government's budgetary policy and the evolving state of the public finances.

#### **Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 4 October 2013, Mr. Paradis (Brome-Missisquoi) would question Mr. Marceau, Minister of Finance and the Economy, during an interpellation on "the Parti Québécois Government's disastrous results with regard to public finance management".

26 September 2013

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Government Bills

#### *Passage in Principle*

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 236, Mr. Bédard, Minister responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, moved, —That Bill 41, An Act to amend the Public Service Act mainly with respect to staffing, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and Bill 41 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Traversy, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 41 be referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Public Finance.

The motion was carried.

---

At 12.55 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Traversy, Deputy Government House Leader, Mrs. Poirier, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

### Debates on Reports from Committees

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which, on 10 and 11 June 2013, held public hearings within the framework of special consultations on the management of the Centre hospitalier de l'Université de Montréal by the current director general. The report contains five recommendations.

Mr. Cousineau, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this debate: 51 minutes 18 seconds shall be allotted to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 45 minutes 36 seconds shall be allotted to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 17 minutes 6 seconds shall be allotted to the Second Opposition Group; and 6 minutes shall be allotted to the independent Members. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by any of the parliamentary groups shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in proportion to their representation in the Assembly. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

The debate arose thereon.

The debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 95, no question was put.

\_\_\_\_\_

At 4.36 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Traversy, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Ouimet, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 6.00 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 6.02 o'clock p.m.

**26 September 2013**

---

**Debates Upon Adjournment**

The Assembly held a debate upon adjournment on a question by Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière) addressed to Mr. Lisée, Minister responsible for the Montréal region, about the cutbacks in infrastructures by the Parti Québécois that will make taxpayers pay for the extension of the blue line. Mr. Gaudreault, Minister of Transport, replaced the Minister responsible for the Montréal region for this debate.

---

At 6.15 o'clock p.m., Mr. Ouimet, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 1 October 2013, at 1.45 o'clock p.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*